



agriculture, forestry & fisheries

Department:
Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries
REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA

PELAGIC SCIENTIFIC WORKING GROUP BRANCH: FISHERIES MANAGEMENT

Proposed process to address differing views on analyses related to island closures to pelagic fishing and their impact on penguin recovery

Janet C Coetzee

The DAFF Director Resources Research has indicated that she wishes the current differing views on analyses related to island closures to pelagic fishing reviewed by the International Review Panel during their Workshop scheduled for 1-5 December later this year. She has asked that a procedure be agreed to conduct this process. The proposal below is also informed by initial discussions with the Panel Chair, Dr Tony Smith, on this matter, and is to be discussed at the PWG meeting on Wednesday 23 July.

Terms of Reference for Panel

The Panel is to provide advice on:

- a) What scientific conclusions can be drawn from the present island closure and related analyses regarding the benefits or otherwise of closures to penguin recovery?
- b) What further analyses of available information could help resolve uncertainties about the conclusions?
- c) What would be the benefits to formulating scientific advice of continuing the closures taking into account limited further resources that DAFF could commit to further monitoring and analysis?

Schedule of Meetings and Dates

- 1) Wed 23 July: SWG-PEL meeting at which to present and agree the process in principle, and to clarify the status of recent papers presented concerning penguins which are currently classified as temporarily confidential.
- 2) As soon as possible, a one-day meeting of a SWG-PEL task team consisting of members and observers with interests in this issue be held to:
 - i. Finalise agreement on the process for the review
 - ii. Finalise on what monitoring data series, to which GLM analyses have previously been applied, are to be used for further analyses to inform the review, noting that all such

data must be placed in the public domain; in this regard, the specific issues to be addressed are:

- a) the extension of series already used in Robinson's analyses to include data from 2013;
 - b) whether the Robben island series used in currently temporarily confidential submissions made by Sherley is to be made available; and
 - c) by what date finalised values from these series for 2014 might be available, and whether they are to be taken into account in the analyses to be reviewed.
 - d) Answer questions of clarification (only) on existing analyses.
 - e) Identify from 1-3 persons ("representatives", of whom one is the "leader" and authorised to comment on their behalf) on each of what in effect are the two sides of the debate who will co-ordinate their side's consolidated submissions and participate in prior organisational exchanges with the Panel Chair and the DAFF Director Research.
- 3) Monday 27th October will be the deadline for an initial exchange of "position papers" from all points of view setting out their consolidated arguments, with limited associated reference material, to be forwarded then to all concerned and the Panel.
 - 4) Monday 17th November will be the deadline for "responses only, not new arguments" papers from all points of view, to forward to the other side and to the Panel. Those might also include responses to immediate questions from the Panel should they send any such by Tuesday 4th November (though appreciating that their other commitments might preclude them from doing so). A further week will be allowed (Monday 24th November) for addressing panel requests.
 - 5) December 1-5 Panel review: a maximum of four 90 minute sessions during the first four days will be made available; the Panel is to report their conclusions at the end of the workshop (at least in summary); the Panel will run the sessions concerned asking questions/requesting further analyses (presentations by either side will be limited to what the Panel may request)

Further rules

- 1) All correspondence on this matter between the representatives of either side and the Panel Chair will be copied also to the representatives of the other side and the DAFF Director Research.

Panel composition

Panellists confirmed for the workshop are: Dr Tony Smith (CSIRO, Australia – Chair); Dr Alistair Dunn (NIWA, New Zealand); Prof Andre Punt (U. Washington, USA); Dr Robin Waples (NWFSC, USA); Professor Gunnar Steffanson (U. Iceland, Iceland); Dr Jason Link (NMFS, USA).